

## POLICY WATCH – November 2016

### In This Issue

- America's Next Chapter: North Bay Leadership Council's Response
- A Way Forward - Actions Needed to Be Taken Now
- Reducing the Education Deficit
- Trump Presidency's Impact on California: Nothing Untouched
- The Forgiveness Mandate
- Members in the News



Happy Thanksgiving! In this issue, we explore what lays ahead as we muddle through the uncertainty of a Trump administration.

We give thanks to live in America, a nation that has been a model of democracy for the rest of the world. We are grateful to live in one nation "with liberty and justice for all," because we appreciate that it is our diversity that makes us great. Studies show that diversity is critical for a healthy planet and people, that immigrants are innovators who help drive our economic success, and diverse communities enrich our quality of life in numerous ways.

We leave you with two quotes about gratitude. The first is "In the bad times, choose to grow stronger. In the good times, choose to enjoy fully. In all times, choose to be grateful (Unknown)." And the second is by Albert Schweitzer, who said, "At times, our own light goes out and is rekindled by a spark from another person. Each of us has cause to think with deep gratitude of those who have lighted the flame within us." Let us be there for one another and continue to light the flame of justice and equality.

Best,



Cynthia

### **America's Next Chapter: North Bay Leadership Council's Response**

North Bay Leadership Council has been committed to sound public policy for over 25 years. We are a nonpartisan organization comprised of the leading employers in the North Bay, with a collective workforce of over 25,000 workers. NBLC was founded on the premise that providing leadership on public policy decisions is important to the health of our economy, people and environment.

The Presidential election outcome stunned many. We were not prepared for a Trump Presidency. At NBLC, we see many public policy issues being proposed that will need to be addressed. We recognize that in a democratic system, there is great need for working together for the common good.

There is also an imperative to stop actions and policies that are an affront to moral decency and humanity. In the coming days, NBLC will hope for the best but prepare for the worst. We will seek out like minded organizations and people who share our great concern about people losing their healthcare, deportation of immigrants, loss of women's rights, denial of climate change and the rise of racism, misogyny, religious persecution, anti-LGBTQ acts and other forms of hate and prejudice.

We will hold the policymakers accountable for their actions by supporting those that strengthen our democracy, economy and quality of life and opposing actions that are the antithesis of American values of one nation for all and inclusion. NBLC will be engaged, positive and present. We hope you will, too.

NBLC will continue to provide data and evidence to support our positions and advocacy. Some said this election was a harbinger of a post-truth world. We do not accept that. In our quest for sound public policy, we will seek out the most credible data and share information with you. We value science, we believe in truth and we think that knowledge is power.

NBLC will also look for a path forward. A path where the Bay Area continues to be an economic leader but also acknowledges that we must invest in the education and training of people, and find ways to not leave displaced workers behind. We know that the workplace is becoming more automated and that there are millions more people at risk of being displaced. We want to spur the creation of more good-paying jobs in our region and nationally so that people have jobs which provide paychecks and perhaps, more importantly, meaning and purpose in their lives. A path that provides equity in pay and rewards hard work and innovation.

We know you can't stop the future. Despite promises to restore manufacturing and coal mining jobs, those jobs are not coming back. The articles following this one offer some ideas on new initiatives such as creating "New Collar" jobs or "middle skill" jobs. And how to "unleash the potential of all people."

While some may fear the diversity of Americans today, we know that this is the source of our greatness. We prize our multi-cultural population and welcome new immigrants to add to that greatness. We do not fear globalization. We look forward to an even brighter tomorrow because of who and what we are now and what we are becoming.

## A Way Forward - Actions Needed to Be Taken Now



Ginni Rometty, Chairman, President and CEO of IBM, wrote a letter to the President-Elect offering a good roadmap on how we might work together with the new administration. Here is an excerpt:

"Dear Mr. President-elect:

I am writing to offer ideas that I believe will help achieve the aspiration you articulated and that can advance a national agenda in a time of profound change. I do so as the leader of the nation's largest technology employer, its leading patent creator, and the company that for more than 105 years has believed that prosperity and progress can be achieved by unleashing the potential of all people. Permit me to offer a few specific suggestions:

### Creating "New Collar" Jobs

Getting a job at today's IBM does not always require a college degree; at some of our centers in the United States, as many as one third of employees have less than a four-year degree. What matters most is relevant skills, sometimes obtained through vocational training. In addition, we are creating and hiring to fill "new collar" jobs – entirely new roles in areas such as cybersecurity, data science, artificial intelligence and cognitive business.

You've spoken about the importance of vocational education, and we agree. IBM has championed a new educational model for the United States – six-year public high schools that combine traditional education with the best of community colleges, mentoring, and real-world job experience. The first of these schools opened with IBM's support 5 years ago in New York; we have hired some of the first graduates. There will soon be 100 such schools across the country. With your support, we could do much more. Let's work together to scale up this approach of vocational training, creating a national corps of skilled workers trained to take the "new collar" IT jobs that are in demand here in America.

#### Building Intelligent, Secure Infrastructure

You've said we need to invest in America's infrastructure, and we agree. As we build big, let's also build smart. The country should focus on infrastructure investments that incorporate Internet of Things (IoT) technology and artificial intelligence to improve performance. And as infrastructure gets smarter, it also increases the need for cybersecurity, so that vital networks cannot be compromised. We recommend that your infrastructure package include incentives for states and localities to build intelligent – and secure – roads, bridges, buildings, and other public facilities.

#### Healthcare: Applying Lessons from Private Sector Experience

IBM operates one of the largest employer-sponsored health plans in the United States. In 2009, IBM offered 15 specific ideas for how America could save more than \$900 billion over ten years through common-sense reforms to the healthcare system, leveraging lessons learned in the private sector. These included using data analytics to reduce fraudulent Medicare claims, improving the exchange of healthcare information among providers, and leveraging the government's purchasing power to lower the cost of drugs and care. IBM will update its recommendations for the healthcare system and hopes to work with Congress and your HHS Secretary to drive better healthcare at lower cost.

#### Using Data to Fight Government Waste and Inefficiency

Eight years ago, IBM helped lead an effort to identify \$1 trillion in savings the federal government could achieve through using advanced data analytics, data center consolidation, and the use of cloud technologies to improve the cybersecurity of key government systems. As part of the Technology CEO Council of which I am a member, we will prepare an updated set of recommendations for how you could use technology and fraud analytics to save the government more than \$1 trillion.

#### Bringing Money Home to Invest in America

IBM supports your proposal to make American's tax system more competitive. Many billions of dollars of American companies' earnings do not come home because of an outdated and punitive tax system. Your tax reform proposal will free up capital that companies of all sizes can reinvest in their U.S. operations, training and education programs for their employees, and research and development programs. We will support the efforts of your administration and Congress to pass tax reform early in 2017.

#### Taking Care of Our Veterans – With the World's Best Technology

All of us at IBM share your gratitude and devotion to the men, women and families who serve our country. More must be done to give our vets the best medical care possible. So we recently announced a pilot program with the Department of Veterans Affairs to help its oncologists treat 10,000 veterans through the power of precision medicine and genomic analysis powered by IBM's cognitive computing system, Watson. We hope to work with your VA Secretary to expand this collaboration.

Mr. President-elect, IBM's roots are in the United States. We are investing, hiring, and continuing to reinvent our company for long-term competitiveness. At more than 50 major locations across the country,

we hired more U.S. employees last year than in the previous five years. We are opening new innovation centers and business units across the country. We are proud of the work we do here in the United States, just as we are proud of the work we do in more than 175 countries around the world.

In the years ahead there will be issues on which we agree, and issues on which we do not. But as you prepare to take office as our new president, I hope the ideas I have offered in this letter represent ways that we can work together to achieve prosperity that is broadly shared in our society.”

## Reducing the Education Deficit



Also sharing ideas on education and job creation is Anthony Carnevale, in [Trump has promised manufacturing jobs, but high school grads might want to seek credentialed “middle-skills” posts instead](#), (Hechinger Report [Link](#)), says “The key growth in U.S. employment has come in offices and non-office settings like hospitals and schools. These include jobs in healthcare, information technology, financial services, office-based clerical and administrative work, and skilled workers in construction, repair, and machinery operations. We talk frequently in this country about income inequality.

But what we really have is an education deficit.”

Carnevale says, “Changes in consumption patterns have led to the expansion of business sectors with more educated workers. Increased productivity has left consumers, by and large, with more money to spend, and demanding more sophisticated and customized products. This, in turn, has led to more layers in the production recipes for consumer goods, and more companies (like marketers and distributors) taking a piece of the revenue. Our increasing comfort and demands have led to a desire for more high-end products, and growth in the information, finance and business sectors.”

He points out, “All of these factors have contributed to the growth of “middle-skill jobs.” They account for 36 percent of all jobs. By contrast, the low-skill service sector of retail and food and personal services (the quintessential McJobs sector) accounts for 19 percent of all jobs. Manufacturing production jobs are even more rare: just 9 percent of the workforce.”

Carnevale says, “We talk frequently in this country about income inequality. But what we really have is an education deficit. Not everyone can get a Bachelor’s degree, and not everyone should, but workers also must realize that high school is simply not enough anymore. These “middle-skill jobs,” on average, pay close to the median earnings of all full-time, full-year workers (\$42,000), if not more. They are good jobs that pay without a B.A. Most require, however, some postsecondary credentials, whether it be an Associate’s degree, a certificate, a license, or a certification.

He thinks, “Americans are responding to this new reality – 25 percent of workers had some college in 1967; now 61 percent of workers have some credentials beyond high school. We expect that about 20 percent of high school graduates, almost all men, can achieve a middle-class income through jobs that mostly involve skilled manual labor. But that still leaves nearly one-fifth of workers with not enough education or skills to thrive in the modern economy.”

Calling for a paradigm shift, Carnevale says, “Reflexively, we tend to favor manufacturing jobs over service-sector jobs, but that doesn’t make sense. Rather than giving false hope, the United States should be investing in training and education that meets these workers where they live. This is a challenge, but it has the virtue of being connected to the actual, existing economy, rather than the economy’s idealized past.”

It is time to be strategic and realistic about where the economy is going. The clock cannot be turned back, the jobs that were lost were ended for good reason. We must invest in robot-proofing our education and stimulating the creativity of our job creators.

## Trump Presidency’s Impact on California: Nothing Untouched



Getting to the meat of what public policy issues we will face in California in the coming year, we see that nothing will be untouched by the proposed changes. In [Unfunded or undone: A Trump presidency eyes California policies](#), by the Calmatters Team ([Link](#)), the authors say, “As a state bluer than Lake Tahoe in sunlight, California has adopted a slew of progressive policies that drive Donald Trump nuts. They combat climate change, protect undocumented immigrants, evangelize for Obamacare and more. As candidate Trump morphed into [President-elect Trump](#)—uncertainty swept the state. While protesters hit the streets and the hashtag #Calexit spiked with residents semi-seriously advocating U.S. secession, policy-makers scrambled to identify state programs at risk in the coming Trump administration.”

“The Legislature’s top leaders, both Democrats, issued a rare [joint statement](#) promising to “maximize the time during the presidential transition to defend our accomplishments using every tool at our disposal. We will be reaching out to federal, state and local officials to evaluate how a Trump presidency will potentially impact federal funding of ongoing state programs, job-creating investments reliant on foreign trade, and federal enforcement of laws affecting the rights of people living in our state,” said Senate President Pro Tem Kevin de Leon of Los Angeles and Assembly Speaker Anthony Rendon of Paramount.”

“Here’s a look at policies that experts say are in jeopardy of being unfunded, undercut or utterly undone:”

### **The environment:**

There may be no greater point of departure from the policies of a Trump administration than California’s leading-edge environmental programs. On Thursday, Gov. Jerry Brown issued a [statement](#) noting the country’s deep divisions. “In California, we will do our part to find common ground whenever possible,” he said. “But as Californians, we will also stay true to our basic principles. We will protect the precious rights of our people and continue to confront the existential threat of our time—devastating climate change.” By way of contrast, candidate Trump tweeted and often repeated his view that climate change is a hoax invented by China.

“The overwhelming majority of our climate programs are rooted in state law,” said Annie Notthoff, the director of California advocacy for the Natural Resources Defense Council. “The California public, time and time again, has supported state action on climate. More than 60 percent of voters are willing to pay more for clean energy. You have a very willing public and strong laws.”

Other big areas of concern are regulatory issues like air pollution and water policy. “Trump has reportedly tapped Myron Ebell, a well-known climate skeptic, to lead his Environmental Protection Agency transition team. The agency has a broad portfolio: overseeing federal air and water laws, regulating toxic substances and setting national emissions standards for automobiles and industry. As such, it is frequently in the crosshairs of business interests and Republicans in Congress who perceive it as an overlord issuing onerous regulations.”

For example, “When California attempted to exercise special authority to regulate tailpipe emissions, it initially tried and failed to get a waiver from the federal EPA to do so under the Bush administration in 2005. Only after President Obama’s election and intervention in the process in 2009 did the EPA grant California its waiver. That episode underscores the fed authority to override state intentions.”

Ethan Elkind, director of the Climate Program at UC Berkeley School of Law, says, “Congress could preempt most of California’s climate agenda if they had the political support to do that,” he said. “Once the federal government takes an action on an issue, they could preempt the field.” We could expect Gov. Brown to fight those actions.

“The federal government also plays a significant role in water policy in California, paying for some projects and signing off on others. Case in point: According to an economic analysis commissioned by the state, California’s water fix in the Delta is dependent on federal help. Gov. Jerry Brown’s plan to build 40-foot wide tunnels to ferry water from the Sacramento River to serve cities and farms to the south is only viable with \$4 billion in funding from Washington, the report found.” And Trump stated he believes there is no drought.

“California is also vulnerable to offshore oil drilling -- a Trump-appointed Interior Secretary could order federal agencies here to open more land on and offshore for energy prospecting. On the clean energy front, California has been at the forefront in both renewable energy production and clean energy innovation. Both emerging sectors have been incubated by billions in federal tax incentives and research grants that could evaporate at any time.”

The state’s push to decarbonize the energy grid and electrify transportation is supported in part by tax credits and rebates that are entirely discretionary. While the solar energy industry is robust and enjoys a wide market, other programs are less able to wean off federal assistance. “A lot of our efforts in California are supported by the federal government. Our electric car goals are supported by federal tax credits and funding, as is the electric vehicle charging infrastructure, the battery storage technology...” Elkind said. “Federal support makes it cheaper for us to meet the carbon reduction goals we have in California, which are in danger if we see a retrenching in policy.”

#### **Health care:**

“The Affordable Care Act, or Obamacare, hangs in the balance after the sweeping win on Tuesday by President-elect Donald Trump, who called it “a catastrophe” and promised to kill it immediately. This week GOP leaders continued to cite its repeal as their top priority. That has big implications for California, a state that enthusiastically embraced the federal expansion and relied on federal dollars to pay for it. “Can he effectively limit the program as of the first day or early in the administration? Absolutely,” said Gerald Kominski, director of the UCLA Center for Health Policy Research. “He’s not going to be able to have any credibility with his constituents if he starts waffling on day one.”



Kominski said the Trump administration could begin to dismantle the program almost immediately by taking away federal funding. California receives \$20 billion a year through the program—both for subsidies that allow some 1.2 million people to purchase health insurance on the Covered California state exchange, and to fund its expansion of Medi-Cal health care to cover an additional 4 million people who can't afford to buy health insurance on their own."

"Of course, Trump hasn't just promised to repeal Obamacare—he's vowed to replace it. But other than extolling the virtues of "the free market," Trump's health care plan is vague—there are no details about a complete replacement plan that would provide insurance options for those that would be dumped from the exchange. Kominski said in California up to 3 million people could lose coverage—and that if funding is hollowed out, California lawmakers will have tough decisions to make."

"The administration could, of course, break the Affordable Care Act into pieces—keeping some popular components such as allowing young people to stay on their parents' insurance until they are 26. That's the expectation of Sandra Hernandez, president and CEO of the California Health Care Foundation, a nonprofit that works to improve health care access for low-income Californians."

### **Immigration:**

"Immigrant advocates are already mobilizing to challenge the promises of President-elect Trump, who vowed to create a deportation force to expel up to 11 million undocumented immigrants. "Our state has long been a leader in working to protect rights of immigrants in the face of harmful federal policies," said Cynthia Buiza, executive director of the California Immigrant Policy Center. "Thus we call on Gov. Brown and all of the leaders in our state—and all people of conscience—to demonstrate bold leadership and do everything in their power to protect each and every immigrant who calls our state and our nation home."

"After Trump appointed Kansas Secretary of State Kris Kobach Secretary to his transition team, California Secretary of State Alex Padilla on Thursday released a statement calling it "a deeply troubling message that telegraphs an imminent assault on our collective voting rights and civil rights. His participation is a threat to diverse communities throughout our nation. Kobach's pattern of supporting racist, anti-immigrant policies including voter suppression and racial profiling laws, such as Arizona's SB 1070, are not only divisive, but have repeatedly been found unconstitutional." The Arizona measure would have required police to demand proof of citizenship if they suspected someone of not being a citizen."

"Advocates are especially worried about the four-year-old Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals program, which allows young people brought to the country as children who meet certain requirements to work legally without fear of deportation. It currently protects nearly 800,000 young people—nearly half of them Californians. President Obama created this program through an executive order. A President Trump has promised to "immediately terminate" it."

"If they repeal the executive actions, they have to face the fact that they would transfer more than half a million legal workers into the shadows," said Joseph Villela, policy director for the Coalition for Humane Immigrant Rights Los Angeles. Villela said the administration would have to take the economy into account before canceling DACA or deporting millions of people, many who hold jobs in top immigrant labor sectors like agriculture and construction. "

"Trump has also promised to stop federal funds for sanctuary cities, which have ended or stopped cooperating with immigration enforcers. There are more than 30 sanctuary cities in the nation and many of them are in California, including San Francisco, Oakland, Los Angeles and Santa Ana. Immigrant

advocate groups, cities and others concerned about these changes started meeting almost immediately after the election but are not yet revealing their exact strategies going forward.”

#### **Education:**

“California made college accessible and affordable for undocumented immigrants when Gov. Brown signed legislation in 2011 granting them access to in-state tuition and financial aid. Fear that Trump would try to roll that back—not to mention pursuing deportation—coursed through college campuses across the state this week. While a Trump administration might pursue deportation efforts, activists insist he can’t touch any protections for immigrants enshrined in state law.”

“We feel these protections are sound and will remain in place once Trump takes office,” said Carlos Amador, lead organizer for the California Immigrant Policy Coalition, a nonprofit advocacy group based in Los Angeles. Seeking to quell students’ anxiety, University of California President Janet Napolitano released a statement with UC’s chancellors pledging to root out intolerance and squash it. “In light of yesterday’s election results, we know there is understandable consternation and uncertainty,” Napolitano wrote. But “diversity is central to our mission” and “we remain absolutely committed to supporting all members of our community.”

“Trump’s appointment to the U.S. Supreme Court, however, could have huge implications for California’s labor unions. Earlier this year, several weeks after Justice Antonin Scalia’s death, the court deadlocked 4-4 in Friedrichs v. California Teachers Association, a case that sought to strip public-sector unions of their right to collect fees from workers who choose not to join. Once Trump appoints Scalia’s replacement, the case could be revived —and likely wouldn’t be decided in the union’s favor, said Jack Pitney, a political science expert at Claremont McKenna College. “It’s not that Trump himself is focused on this case. But the strategists around him surely are,” Pitney said. “If I were a CTA official, I wouldn’t be sleeping well these days.”

#### **The economy:**

“California’s \$2.4 trillion economic engine, the sixth-largest largest economy in the world, has outpaced the rest of the nation on multiple fronts: job growth, wages and housing prices. The technology industry continues to flourish and exports are up 31 percent from the recession. But the election of Donald Trump is causing some economic forecasters to change their outlook.”

“Beacon Economics released a report warning that Trump’s pledge to slash taxes would widen the federal deficit; bowing out of U.S. commitments to free trade would disrupt supply chains and drive up consumer prices; and deporting millions of immigrants without legal documents would cause massive disruption, let alone trigger a “human tragedy.” “Any of these three issues, if pursued vigorously, has the potential to cause a recession,” writes Christopher Thornberg, one of the authors.”

“California business interests are gearing up to protect the Trans-Pacific Partnership, an agreement among 12 Pacific Rim countries to expand trade. The deal is touted by supporters for boosting sales of everything from laptops to almonds, and adding jobs in a state that already exports \$71.6 billion of goods to those partner countries. Peter Leroe-Munoz, vice president of technology and innovations at the Silicon Valley Leadership Group, said trade-related jobs pay 15 to 18 percent higher than workers whose companies only sell domestically. “As Silicon Valley adjusts to the new political reality, we’re still hopeful,” Leroe-Munoz said. “We’re working to make sure President-elect Trump has the full picture of the innovation economy. ... We’re fully aware this is going to be a big political lift.”



“A Trump presidency also brings uncertainty for tens of thousands working in California’s shipping industry, says Robert Kleinhenz, another economist with Beacon Economics. For example, the ports of Los Angeles and Long Beach make up the largest port complex in the Western Hemisphere and handles 30 to 40 percent of containers that flow into the country. “Just the idea that he would like to revisit our trade agreements in the Pacific Rim certainly raises concerns about goods flow in California,” Kleinhenz said.”

“Since the adoption of the Affordable Care Act, California has been drawing down significantly more federal dollars to help insure low-income residents. This year, the state is expecting \$96 billion from Washington, D.C., on top of its own \$171 billion budget. Less clear are the big-ticket, controversial infrastructure projects like California’s high-speed rail. While Trump has endorsed federal infrastructure spending, his fellow Republicans in Congress are wary of increased federal spending. Trump has also suggested spurring infrastructure spending through public-private partnerships but thus far, it’s unclear if companies will invest their own capital to help build and operate the bullet train.”

California has always been a “donor state,” paying the Federal government more than it gets back. It looks like that equation is about to get very uneven. The ramifications of the worst case scenarios are truly staggering.

## The Forgiveness Mandate



Many of us seek to forgive those that have hurt us, especially in this divisive campaign. Family members are dreading Thanksgiving and worrying about how to deal with relatives that have taken positions hateful to them. Others of us want to “move on,” from the rancor of the election. Are all things forgivable? If not, what is the ethics of forgiveness?

Art Kleiner writes in [The Forgiveness Mandate](#) (strategy and business, November 4, 2016), “In the end, some acts are unforgivable, and that (for me) includes some of the things Trump said on the campaign trail, whether they were intended theatrically or not.” Kleiner goes on to explore where that line is on forgiving and unforgivable.

He says, “it’s an intensely practical question, and not just for elections. Everyone employed by an organization works with imperfect colleagues who, often with the best of intentions, sometimes manipulate others, hide information, shade the truth, cheat, or lie. Self-interest is often a factor, but rarely the only reason for their actions.”

Kleiner continues, “You might respond to these acts with absolute condemnation: Forgive nothing, if only for the sake of fairness. After all, many people play by the rules, and they should not be penalized by comparison. Conversely, you might be inclined to forgive everything. A great deal of creativity would be lost if we tolerated no rule-breaking. Or you might just throw up your hands, let virtue be God’s (or someone else’s) responsibility, and avoid judging the candidates altogether. Base your vote solely on the policies they espouse.”

“But it’s not feasible to condemn all or nothing; some transgressions are clearly more unforgivable than others. Nor can you ignore temperament and integrity as factors in choosing a leader. They matter at least as much as policy. You have to cultivate your judgment; to build a sophisticated, nuanced, authentic sense — your own sense — of which misdeeds are worthy of forgiveness and which are not,” says Kleiner.

Kleiner tells us, “When we choose who to vote for, we judge the candidates as we would judge potential allies. Since everyone we meet is likely to be flawed in some way, we must choose our alliances based on what we are willing to forgive. As the campaign has progressed, I’ve tried to parse my choice in terms of forgiveness. I’ve listed the transgressions that seem reasonably likely to be true, if only because they fit with what I know of human nature. Then I ask myself: Which of these are forgivable? (The same forgiveness applies whether or not the candidate is nominated by my preferred party.) I include some misdeeds committed by the candidates’ family members, close associates, and advisors, if they seem relevant to the candidate’s own temperament. Then I ask: If I committed (or tolerated and approved) a similar act in the course of everyday business, would I expect and hope to be forgiven? Or would I hold myself accountable for perpetrating a genuinely harmful act?”

Kleiner says, “Forgiveness doesn’t mean forgetting the transgressions, any more than truth and reconciliation means acquiescing to power. Forgiveness means putting those acts in perspective. It means choosing not to let a misdeed, despite all the pain it has caused, disqualify a person from inclusion in your association. A candidate who doesn’t express remorse is harder to forgive. But that’s not the only relevant factor.”

“Forgiveness has consequences, says Kleiner. “If enough of us learned to forgive more effectively, it would be good for the culture. One of the most moving public moments of the last few years came in June 2015, when the relatives of the victims of the Emanuel AME church shooting in Charleston, S.C., publicly forgave the white supremacist who had killed nearly a dozen congregants.”

Kleiner concludes, “The 2016 election is challenging us all to hone our forgiveness skills. We can’t forgive everything the candidates have done. But if we forgive nothing, we and the world will be paralyzed. And the need for skillful forgiveness — for making choices about allies and candidates in a thoughtful, deliberate way, conscious of their misdeeds — won’t go away. We’d better hope we’re moving toward a world where more and more is forgiven, not less and less. Consider the alternative.”

And to reinforce why we need to forgive more, Charles Griswold, in [On Forgiveness](#), [\(Link\)](#) says, “What makes it the commendable thing to do at the appropriate time? It’s not simply a matter of lifting the burden of toxic resentment or of immobilizing guilt, however beneficial that may be ethically and psychologically. It is not a merely therapeutic matter, as though this were just about you. Rather, when the requisite conditions are met, forgiveness is what a good person would seek because it expresses fundamental moral ideals. These include ideals of spiritual growth and renewal; truth-telling; mutual respectful address; responsibility and respect; reconciliation and peace.”

## Members in the News

### Sonoma State University Participating in #GivingTuesday on Nov. 29

On November 29, Sonoma State University will again participate in #GivingTuesday, a global effort dedicated to donating to nonprofit organizations following the spending craze of Black Friday and Cyber Monday.

## **Buck Institute for Research on Aging Spotlited on Maria Shriver's Report on Programs That Reverses Cognitive Decline**

A new experimental program from the Buck Institute for Research on Aging's neurologist Dr. Dale Bredesen is showing positive results in patients with Alzheimer's disease.

## **Redwood Credit Union Makes One of 15 Best Credit Union Credit Cards**

Credit union credit cards often carry lower interest rates than their big bank counterparts.

**Read more online at** [www.northbayleadership.org/news](http://www.northbayleadership.org/news)



### **Who We Are**

Over twenty years ago, business leaders founded the North Bay Leadership Council on a simple premise: We can accomplish more by working together. Today, the Council includes 47 leading employers in the North Bay. Our members represent a wide variety of businesses, non-profits and educational institutions, with a workforce in excess of 25,000. As business and civic leaders, our goal is to promote sound public policy, innovation and sustainability to make our region a better place to live and work. For more information: Call 707.283.0028 / E-mail [info@northbayleadership.org](mailto:info@northbayleadership.org)

[www.northbayleadership.org](http://www.northbayleadership.org)